MINUTES

Regular Meeting

Carson City Board of Equalization Tuesday, February 12, 2019 ● 9:00 AM

Community Center Sierra Room 851 East William Street, Carson City, Nevada

Board Members:

Chair – Jed Block Member – Carson McFadden Member – Jill Rasner Member – Roy Semmens

Member - Mallory Wilson

Staff:

Dave Dawley, Assessor Kimberly Adams, Chief Deputy Assessor Denise Gillott, Chief Property Appraiser Jeremy Saposnek, Property Appraiser Buffy Okuma, Deputy District Attorney Tamar Warren, Deputy Clerk

NOTE: A recording of these proceedings, the Board's agenda materials, and any written comments or documentation provided to the recording secretary during the meeting are public record. These materials are on file in the Clerk-Recorder's Office, and available for review during regular business hours.

A. CALL TO ORDER AND DETERMINATION OF QUORUM

Chairperson Block called the meeting to order at 9:01 a.m. Roll was called. A quorum was present.

Attendee Name	Status	Arrived/Left
Chairperson Jed Block	Present	
Member Carson McFadden	Present	
Member Jill Rasner	Present	
Member Roy Semmens	Present	
Member Mallory Wilson	Present	

B. PUBLIC COMMENT

Chairperson Block entertained public comments; however, none were forthcoming.

Ms. Okuma swore in the parties that would testify that day.

C. For Possible Action: REVIEW AND POSSIBLE ACTION ON STIPULATION AGREEMENT FOR WAL-MART REAL ESTATE BUSINESS TRUST, 3200 MARKET STREET, APN 002-755-11.

Chairperson Block introduced the item. Mr. Dawley gave background and presented the Assessor's Recommendation, incorporated into the record, which was to designate the subject property as a Mega Discount Warehouse Store instead of a Discount Warehouse Store because the building square footage was over 200,000 square feet. He also noted that an agreement had been reached with the appellant for a stipulated taxable value of \$13,858,547 and a total assessed value of \$4,850,491.

Ms. Okuma recommended that the Chair admit the documents received by the Board, as part of the agenda materials, into the record. Chairperson Block admitted the information supplied by the Assessor's Office into the record and entertained public comments or a motion.

MOTION: Member Wilson moved to approve the value change stipulation for parcel number 002-755-11 which reduces the total taxable value to \$13,858,547. Member Semmens seconded the motion. Motion carried 5-0-0.

D. For Possible Action: REVIEW AND POSSIBLE ACTION ON STIPULATION AGREEMENT FOR WILLIAM D. LANDRY 0402 TRUST, WILLIAM D. LANDRY TRUSTEE, 3201 SOUTH CARSON STREET, APN 009-112-08.

Chairperson Block introduced the item. Ms. Gillott presented the subject property information and the Assessor's Office recommendation, both of which are incorporated into the record. She explained that the appellant's estimate was based on one parcel lacking street frontage, another not having utilities on site, and the third needing a fire hydrant installation. Ms. Gillott also noted that both the Carson City Planning Division and the Public Works Department had concurred that the reasons stated by the appellant would affect the overall value and marketability of the parcel. Ms. Gillott recommended that the Board approve the stipulation agreed to by the appellant and the Assessor's Office, which was a reduced stipulated taxable value of \$561,314. Chairperson Block inquired about adjacent properties that had similar issues and Ms. Gillott clarified that they were developed properties and that they had already brought in their water, adding that they were not as narrow as the subject property. Chairperson Block entered into public record the contents of the agenda materials provided by the Assessor's Office and entertained public comments. When none were forthcoming, he entertained a motion.

MOTION: Member Rasner moved to agree with the recommendation of the Assessor's Office to reduce the taxable value of parcel number 009-112-08 commonly known as 3201 South Carson Street to \$561,314. The motion was seconded by Member Semmens. Motion carried 5-0-0.

E. For Possible Action: HEARING AND POSSIBLE ACTION ON PETITION FOR REVIEW OF ASSESSED VALUATION OF WESTDALE CAPITAL INV. 1 LTD., 3809 NORTH CARSON STREET, APN 002-391-35.

Chairperson Block introduced the item. Mr. Dawley noted that the appellant who was scheduled to testify via telephone had not wished to do so; therefore, the Chair invited the Assessor's Office to present the Assessor's Evidence which is incorporated into the record, along with the Appellant's Evidence. Mr. Saposnek introduced the subject property and explained that the appeal form sent by the appellant's representative indicated the taxable value of the property to be \$407,000, compared to the taxable value of \$578,106 determined by the Assessor's Office, adding that "an enormous amount of data" supported the latter value. Mr. Saposnek referenced recent property and land sales of competing properties, incorporated into the record, which supported their recommendation along with income approach (\$786,000) calculations. He also recommended the retention of the current total taxable value of \$578,106 and the estimated market value of \$1.2 million.

Member Wilson commented that while reviewing the Appellant's Evidence she had observed that the appellant's income approach to value was based on a vacancy rate of 16.7 percent and a cap rate of nine percent which she

believed were not figures seen in this area at this time. She was also in agreement with the Assessor's recommendation of a 10 percent vacancy rate and a 7 percent cap rate. Member Semmens noted that the accounting sheet listed repairs and maintenance for \$6,629; however, no details were given on what they were used. Chairperson Block admitted all the evidence (both the Appellant's and the Assessor's) in the binder into the record. He also entertained public comments and when none were forthcoming, a motion.

MOTION: Member Wilson moved to retain the [taxable] value for parcel number 002-391-35 in the amount of \$578,106. The motion was seconded by Member Semmens. Motion carried 5-0-0.

F. For Possible Action: HEARING AND POSSIBLE ACTION ON PETITION FOR REVIEW OF ASSESSED VALUATION OF CRAIG STEELE FAMILY TRUST, CRAIG C. STEELE TRUSTEE, 2263 MOUTON DRIVE, APN 008-851-05.

Chairperson Block introduced the item. Member Semmens disclosed that he had known the appellant for 25 years as a neighbor; however, he was not familiar with any of Mr. Steele's personal business. He also explained to Ms. Okuma that it would not disqualify him from voting on the item. Ms. Gillott gave background and presented the recommendation of the Assessor's Office which was based on their approaches to value and the Appellant's Evidence. She recommended a stipulated value of \$657,403, utilizing a 36 percent reduction on improvements through economic obsolescence.

Appellant Craig Steele introduced himself and confirmed his agreement to and support of the stipulated value. Chairperson Block thanked Mr. Steele and admitted into the record the agenda materials pertaining to this item. He also entertained a motion since there were no public comments.

MOTION: Member McFadden moved to adjust the taxable value of the real property identified as APN 008-851-05 from \$954,420 to \$657,403 for the 2019-2020 Fiscal Year. The motion was seconded by Member Semmens. Motion carried 5-0-0.

G. For Possible Action: DISCUSSION AND POSSIBLE ACTION TO SET THE DATE OF THE NEXT SCHEDULED MEETING, CURRENTLY SET FOR FEBRUARY 19, 2019.

Chairperson Block introduced the item and stated that no other hearing was needed this year.

H. PUBLIC COMMENT

No members of the public were present to comment.

Mr. Dawley expressed his appreciation to the Board for their outstanding work and for "doing your homework".

Member Wilson thanked the Assessor's Office for their preparation of the binders.

I. FOR POSSIBLE ACTION: ADJOURNMENT

MOTION: Member Semmens moved to adjourn. The motion was seconded by Member Rasner. Chairperson Block adjourned the meeting at 9:30 a.m.

The Minutes of the February 12, 2019 Carson City Board of Equalization meeting are respectfully submitted on this 14th day of February, 2019.

AUBR	EY ROWLATT, Clerk – Recorder
By:	
	Tamar Warren, Deputy Clerk